Committees: Streets and Walkways Sub – For decision Projects & Procurement Sub Committee - For information	**Dates:** 9 July 2024 15 July 2024
Subject: Creechurch Lane area improvements (City Cluster programme) Unique Project Identifier: City Cluster Vision Phase one – 12072	**Gateway 3/4: Detailed Options Appraisal (Regular)**
Report of: Executive Director, Environment **Report Author:** Maria Herrera – Transport and Public Realm Projects, City Operations	**For Decision**
PUBLIC	

1. Status update	**Project Description:** This project includes public realm and highway improvements to the Creechurch Lane, Mitre Street and Bury Street area as follows: • Accessibility and walking improvements, including widened pavements, improved pedestrian crossings and sections of raised carriageway. • Public realm improvements and planting to provide a permanent street layout to replace the temporary parklets and planters which were installed in 2021. • Relocation of parking, e-scooter & cycle hire bay and motorcycle bay to provide additional pavement space. **RAG Status:** Green **Risk Status:** Low **Total Estimated Cost of Projects (excluding risk):** £650-£750k for Option 1 (detailed design and construction) £750-£950k for Option 2 (detailed design and construction) **Change in Total Estimated Cost (excluding risk):** £500K-780K, cost range provided at G1-2.

	Spend to Date: £ 19,880 (staff costs) **Funding source:** Section 106 contributions that have been allocated to the City Cluster Programme along with a funding contribution from the EC BID. **Costed Risk Provision Utilised:** NA **Slippage:** NA
2. Next steps and requested decisions	**Next Gateway:** Gateway 5 **–** January 2025 (delegated to Chief Officer for decision) **Next Steps:** • Detailed engagement with stakeholders and occupiers to consult on proposals. • Draft traffic management orders and statutory advertising process. • Organise trial holes as required to assess the viability of planting trees. • Detailed design stage following completion of statutory consultation on traffic orders. **Requested Decisions:** I. Approve recommended Option 1 to reach the next gateway, which involves widening of pavements on the eastern side of Creechurch Lane, the reallocation of parking and paving of carriageway and junction in granite setts. II. Approve the budget of £60,000 (staff costs and fees) for the project to reach the next gateway, funded from the Section 106 agreement for the 40 Leadenhall Street development. III. Note the total estimated cost of the project at £650K-780K for Option 1 (excluding risk). IV. Authorise officers to finalise a funding letter to receive the external funding contribution from the EC BID. V. Agree to delegate to the Chief Officer the approval and drawdown of the costed risk provision at the next gateway. VI. Agree to undertake the process to prepare the traffic orders to relocate payment, motorcycle, e-scooters and cycle hire parking in the area in advance of Gateway 5 stage. VII. Authorise the Executive Director Environment to consider responses to the traffic order consultation and if they consider it appropriate, to make the Order.
3. Resource requirements to	**For recommended Option 1:**

reach next Gateway

Table 1: Budget required to reach Gateway 5

Description	**Resources required to reach next Gateway (£)**
Highways Staff Costs	18,000
P&T Staff Costs	25,000
City Gardens Staff Costs	1,000
Fees and surveys (including traffic management orders, detailed design, ground investigations and trial holes)	16,000
TOTAL	**£60,000**

Costed Risk Provision requested for this Gateway: No risk provision is required at this stage.

4. Overview of project options

4.1 The Creechurch Lane area improvements are part of the City Cluster programme. The project will provide an improved and safer environment for people walking, wheeling, cycling and/or spending time in the area. There is also the potential to introduce greenery and tree planting, subject to underground utilities.

4.2 The pavements and streets in the area are currently in poor condition, with narrow pavements, and a lack of accessible crossings points. This project seeks to rebalance the streetscape to provide additional space on pavements, provide level crossings at the junctions with tactile paving, and support the local economy by enhancing the area.

4.3 This network of streets contains busy walking routes for visitors and workers and is located in the vicinity of a primary school and residential flats. This scheme is looking to improve the overall quality of the street environment, ensuring it is safe and easy to navigate, whilst maintaining the current vehicular movements and servicing requirements.

4.4 The two options consider the relocation of payment parking bays (previously called pay & display bays), motorcycle and e-scooter & cycle hire bays to deliver an improved street environment. The contraflow cycle lane is also to be retained in both options.

4.5 The two options are summarised below:

Option 1:

- Widening the pavement on the eastern side of Creechurch Lane to provide additional pavement space in the section of street with ground floor activity.

	• Resurfacing Creechurch Lane with asphalt and introducing a raised junction at Mitre Street and Bury Street, paved in granite setts. **Option 2:** • Includes widening the pavement on both sides of Creechurch Lane, and therefore only providing minimal pavement gains due to the narrow condition of the street. Resurfacing Creechurch Lane with asphalt and introducing a raised carriageway section at the junction with Mitre Street and Bury Street, paved in granite setts. **Project Options, details:** **4.6 Option 1.** See Appendix 2,3,4 for plans and pictures of the area. • Remove the existing parklets and introduce a wider pavement along the eastern side of Creechurch Lane, raise the carriageway to the level of the pavement at the junction with Creechurch Lane, Mitre Street and Bury Street. • Repave the pavements in York stone and resurface Creechurch Lane in asphalt and the raised carriageway junction in granite setts. • Subject to underground conditions, the project will also consider tree planting, a sustainable drainage planting bed and seating. • Relocate a payment parking bay, motorcycle bay and e-scooter & cycle hire bay from Creechurch Lane to nearby streets: Billiter Street, Bury Street and Mitre Street. • Permanent removal of two payment parking bays, where the parklets are currently located, to extend the pavement and create more space for people walking and wheeling and permanent seating and tables and chairs. • Retain the cycle contraflow route along Creechurch Lane. **4.7 Option 2.** • Remove the existing parklets and introduce wider pavements along the eastern and western side of Creechurch Lane, raise the carriageway to the level of the pavement at the junction with Creechurch Lane, Mitre Street and Bury Street.

	• Repave the pavements in York stone and resurface Creechurch Lane in asphalt and the raised carriageway junction in granite setts. • Subject to underground conditions, the project will also consider tree planting, a sustainable drainage planting bed and seating. • Relocate a payment parking bay, motorcycle bay and e-scooter & cycle hire bay from Creechurch Lane to nearby streets: Billiter Street, Bury Street and Mitre Street. • Permanent removal of two payment parking bays, where the parklets are currently located, to extend the pavement and create more space for people walking and wheeling and permanent seating. • Retain the cycle contraflow route along Creechurch Lane 4.8 The delivery of this project will be complemented with the future changes to Leadenhall Street, which is currently at design stage. The Leadenhall Street project looks to widen the pavements and narrow the carriageway along the length of the Street, accommodating tree planting and greening where feasible. It is also intended, that the work on Leadenhall street will provide an improved junction with Creechurch Lane and provide an additional loading bay on Leadenhall Street for use of the local area. 4.9 For the consideration of these two options a traffic survey was undertaken to determine the type of vehicles using the streets, which has informed the outline design. 4.10 A maintenance budget for granite setts will be considered at the next Gateway to ensure sufficient commuted sums are allocated to the project. <u>4.11 Healthy Streets Design Check (refer to Appendix 6):</u> The current condition of the streets was also assessed utilising the Healthy Streets Design Check, and which will be undertaken again once the preferred design is developed further. 4.12 The initial evaluation concluded that the Healthy Streets scoring of the area will be improved overall as a result of providing wider pavements, an improved quality and finish of the paving material and carriageway. The introduction of greenery

and seating, and the consideration for raised tables at crossing points with tactile paving, also improved the overall outcome of the Healthy streets assessment.

4.13 City of London Street Accessibility Tool (CoLSAT) (refer to Appendix 7) :

The proposed changes will provide a more accessible street environment, with raised pedestrian crossings, tactile paving and improved finishes. The summary of the CoLSAT evaluation is included in the table below. The remaining 0 and 1 scores are largely a result of the narrow pavement on the western side of the street which is unchanged by these proposals. This is mitigated by the widening of the eastern pavement and inclusion of accessible crossings.

Table 1 - CoLSAT Summary Results Table. Creechurch Lane improvements

	Total 0 scores* – severe accessibility issue		Total 1 scores**- significant accessibility issues	
	Before	**After**	Before	**After**
Electric Wheelchair user	1	0	3	2
Manual Wheelchair user	1	0	3	2
Mobility Scooter user	1	0	1	1
Walking Aid user	0	0	2	2
Person with a walking impairment	1	0	5	4
Long cane user	1	0	3	2
Guide Dog user	1	1	1	0
Residual Sight user	0	0	4	2
Deaf or Hearing impairment	0	0	3	3
Acquired neurological impairment	1	1	2	1
Autism/Sensory-processing diversity	0	0	1	1
Developmental Impairment	2	0	3	2

Total	**9**	**2**	**31**	**22**	

* This score means most people in this segment would be excluded by the street characteristic in the selected configuration.

** This score means some people in this segment may be able to negotiate the street characteristic in the selected configuration, but it would significantly deplete their levels of confidence and energy, and they would be likely to give up on the journey if they had to negotiate it more than once or twice.

5. Recommended option

Option 1 is recommended. See Appendix 4 for pictures and visuals.

5.1 Option 1 is recommended as it creates an accessible pavement (i.e. 2m+ on the eastern side of Creechurch Lane where there are a concentration of restaurants and bars. Option 2 widens the pavement on both sides but there are remaining pinch points below 1.5 m.

5.2 Option 1 maximises the potential for pavement widening on the side of the street with active frontages, and provides opportunities for seating, tables and chairs, and greening.

Option 2, whilst making small improvements to the width of pavement on both sides of the street, would leave both sides facing a number of pinch points. Option 1 does not negate all of the issues for people walking and wheeling along the whole length of the eastern pavement, but it does make a more significant difference. The only way to make the street truly accessible for people walking and wheeling would be to pedestrianise it. This is not feasible with the need to access business premises.

5.3 Improving accessibility to only one side of the street is mitigated by the accessibility improvements to the crossing points at the junctions so that people can cross to the eastern side.

5.4 Option 1will include removal of the existing parklets and planters and will also retain the existing cycling contraflow provision on Creechurch Lane.

5.5 The permanent removal of two payment parking bays is proposed where the current parklets are located. This is necessary to create space that can be used for people walking and wheeling and supports the local retail economy. The two payment parking bays have been suspended since 2021 when

	the parklets were first installed. The area has been able to operate effectively without these bays to date. 5.6 Option 1 includes the use of granite setts for the raised junction at Creechurch Lane, Mitre Street and Bury Street. This is a conservation area with an important listed church and the high-quality materials will enhance the setting of the buildings and provide a more pleasant street environment.
6. Risk	6.1 The main risks are as follows: • Underground conditions impact on project scope and cost; Due to existing underground conditions, greening interventions may need to be adapted in certain locations or may not be feasible. • Construction sites in the area impact programme; On-going development construction in the area has the potential to affect or delay the project. • Objection to traffic orders could impact the design and scope of the project. Further information is available in the risk register in the appendix 5. **Costed Risk Provision Utilised at Last Gateway**: None requested at previous gateway report. **Change in Costed Risk**: NA **Costed Risk requested:** A costed risk provision will be allocated at Gateway 5. This report recommends Executive Director delegation to approve and drawdown the funds.
7. Procurement approach	7.1 Management and coordination of the project will be undertaken by the Transport and Public Realm Projects team, in consultation with Highways, City Gardens and the City's highway term contractor. 7.2 Stages of the design work will be undertaken in-house by officers and external consultants will be brought in as required to provide specialist services. 7.3 Construction works are to be implemented by the City's highway term contractor, working in collaboration with City Gardens for the delivery of the soft landscaping elements. 7.4 Appointment of external consultants will be carried out in line with the City's procurement guidelines for capital projects.

Appendices

Appendix 1	Cover Sheet
Appendix 2	General arrangement plan
Appendix 3	Proposed parking arrangements
Appendix 4.	Pictures of the area and proposed improvements.
Appendix 5.	Risk Register
Appendix 6.	Healthy Streets Check; summary diagram
Appendix 7.	COLSAT assessment

Contact

Report Author	Maria Herrera
Email Address	Maria.herrera@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	07526 201100

Options Appraisal Matrix

Option Summary	***Option 1- Recommended*** ***(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)***	***Option 2***
1. Brief description of option	The project considers improving the pedestrian environment along Creechurch Lane and at the junctions with Mitre Street and Bury Street. This will be achieved by: • Creating accessible crossing facilities at junctions, with an area of raised carriageway at the Creechurch lane/Bury Street and Mitre Street. • Providing a wider pavement along the eastern side of Creechurch lane • Resurfacing the carriageway and repave the pavements with Yorkstone. The project will investigate opportunities for tree planting and the introduction of sustainable urban drainage, subject to further site investigations of underground conditions. The ECBID have expressed strong support for the introduction of greening as part of their funding contribution. The temporary parklets currently located on Creechurch Lane have proved to be a popular amenity with the local visitors and workers. This project aims to deliver permanent changes	As per option 1, with the difference being that this option evaluated widening both, eastern and western pavement along Creechurch Lane.

Option Summary	***Option 1- Recommended*** ***(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)***	***Option 2***
	following the trial to support the local retail economy and provide space for people to walk and spend time. A review of the parking/loading provision and traffic flows in the area has been undertaken. The proposed changes are as follows: • Permanent removal of two pay and display bays (CL3 and CL4) which have been out of use since 2021 where the parklets are currently located to extend the pavement and create more space for people walking, planting and to support the local businesses. • Relocation of one pay & display (CL2) which has been out of use since 2021 due to the parklets from Creechurch Lane to Mitre Street. • Relocation of a motorcycle bay (MCL1) from Creechurch Lane to Billiter Street. This revised location is better suited to accommodate motorcycle parking as it is a servicing street with loading bays to nearby office buildings. This will also help to reduce noise and air pollution in the residential and ground floor retail cluster on Creechurch	

Option Summary	***Option 1- Recommended*** ***(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)***	***Option 2***
	Lane and provide a better street environment for users. • Relocation of a dockless bike and scooter bay from Creechurch Lane to Bury Street to consolidate the provision of space for dockless bikes and scooters in the area. • Retention of contraflow cycle lane on Creechurch Lane. Please refer to plans in appendix 2 and 3. **Materials:** • This option considers the resurfacing of Creechurch Lane in asphalt. • Providing a raised carriageway section paved in granite setts at the junction with Bury Street and Mitre Street. • Pavements are to be paved in York stone in line with the City Public Realm Toolkit (2024). The use of granite setts will enhance the setting of the conservation area and improve the setting of the listed church (St Katherin Cree). The high-quality paving materials will enforce the sense of	

Option Summary	*Option 1- Recommended* *(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)*	*Option 2*
	place and provide an improved street environment.	
2. Scope and exclusions	Estimated cost ranges have been provided to account for detailed design, implementation, and maintenance of the project. The project includes re-paving the pavements along Creechurch Lane and at the junctions with Mitre Street and Bury Street. It also includes the resurfacing of Creechurch Lane in asphalt and creating a raised junction paved in granite setts. The scope includes consideration for areas of planting subject to underground utilities and available pavement space. See appendix 2 for scope of project and plans. The project does not include works to the entire length of Bury Street and Mitre Street. The relocation and removal of parking, motorcycle and e-scooter and dockless bays is subject to undertaking the statutory traffic management consultation process.	As per option 1. With the difference being that this option evaluates widening both pavements on Creechurch Lane.
Project Planning		

Option Summary	***Option 1- Recommended*** ***(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)***	***Option 2***
3. Programme and key dates	July - December 2024: • Detailed engagement with stakeholders and occupiers to consult on proposals. • Draft traffic management orders and statutory advertising process. • Organise trial holes as required to assess the viability of planting trees. • Detailed design stage following completion of statutory consultation on traffic orders. • Submission of Gateway 5 report	As per option 1.
4. Risk implications	Overall project option risk*:* Low • Underground conditions impact on project scope and cost; Due to existing underground conditions, greening interventions may need to be adapted in certain locations or may not be feasible. • Construction sites in the area impact programme; On-going development construction in the area has the potential to affect or delay the delivery of projects. • Objection to traffic orders could impact the design and scope of the project.	As per option 1.

Option Summary	*Option 1- Recommended* *(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)*	*Option 2*
	Refer to risk register in appendix 5.	
5. Stakeholders and consultees	The project is part of the City Cluster programme and has been developed in close consultation with the EC BID and the outline design has been shared with the City Cluster programme board, who oversee the development of projects in the area. An initial localised public consultation has been undertaken as part of the temporary installations and ongoing communication has been maintained to inform stakeholders on the proposed changes. Officers will continue to engage to ensure the permanent changes are communicated and discuss with businesses and residents.	As per option 1.
6. Benefits of option	1. Deliver attractive and inclusive spaces for people to walk and spend time in, with a significantly wider pavement (on the eastern side of Creechurch Lane. 2. Provide greenery and provide spaces for people to rest, creating a local destination for city workers and visitors.	1. Deliver attractive and inclusive spaces for people to walk and spend time in, with wider pavements of approximately 1.8-2m on both sides of Creechurch Lane. 2. Provide greenery and spaces for people to rest, creating a local destination for city workers and visitors.

Option Summary	*Option 1- Recommended* *(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)*	*Option 2*
	3. Provide a high-quality environment to enhance the setting of the conservation area and listed buildings. 4. Contribute to the well-being of local users by offering outdoor spaces to rest, work and spend time in, including space for cafes to install outdoor seating. 5. This option has a lower cost due to the works being focussed on the eastern pavement.	3. Provide a high-quality environment to enhance the setting of the conservation area and listed buildings. 4. Contribute to the well-being of local users by offering outdoor spaces to rest, work and spend time in.
7. Disbenefits of option	This option will only provide a wider pavement to the eastern side of Creechurch Lane, with other surfacing improvements on the western pavement. This however is the recommended option as it will provide the space where the active frontages are located and where most people use. The western pavement has no active frontages and has the service entrance from the building.	This option is more expensive due to the desire to realign both kerbs along Creechurch lane. It also provides a marginal gain to both pavements without providing the space on the eastern side of the street, where the local activity and residential buildings are located. This option will not provide sufficient space for cafes to obtain licences for outdoor seating. This option has a higher cost due to the need to alter pavements on both sides and associated levels, drainage and utilities costs.

Option Summary	***Option 1- Recommended*** ***(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)***	***Option 2***
Resource Implications		
8. Total estimated cost	Estimated cost (excluding risk): £650-£780k for the implementation including maintenance.	Estimated cost (excluding risk): £780-£950k for the implementation including maintenance.
9. Funding strategy	This project is proposed to be funded by: • S106 funding (40 Leadenhall Street) • External contribution from EC BID The forthcoming Gateway 5 report will set out detailed cost estimates, including costed risk provision funded from the same source: alongside a construction programme.	As per option 1, with a potential need to secure further funding sources due to the additional cost of realigning both pavements on Creechurch Lane.
10. Investment appraisal	*NA*	As per option 1.
11. Estimated capital value/return	*NA*	As per option 1.
12. Ongoing revenue implications	The streets under consideration are already being maintained by the city. There is a risk that maintenance costs could increase in the coming years and any new green infrastructure and	As per option 1.

Option Summary	*Option 1- Recommended* *(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)*	*Option 2*
	paving will include a maintenance provision within the cost estimate.	
13. Affordability	Details of the funding strategy are set out above. Funding for this project is secured as part of the wider programme.	As per option 1.
14. Legal implications	A legal agreement is required to be completed with the EC BID to receive the contribution towards the project.	As per option 1.
15. Corporate property implications	*None*	As per option 1.
16. Traffic implications	Traffic management orders will be required for the proposed changes in parking provision, location of motorcycle bays, and loading restrictions.	As per option 1.
17. Sustainability and energy implications	Material specification is in line with the City Public Realm Toolkit and standards form the City's term contractor. Works on site will be managed to minimise disruption and make efficient use of paving and modules to reduce waste.	As per option 1.

Option Summary	***Option 1- Recommended*** ***(See Appendix 2-3 for plans of the area)***	***Option 2***
	Subject to underground conditions, greening and tree planting will be explored as part of the next stage of work.	
18. ARE implications	*NA*	As per option 1.
19. Equality Impact Assessment	The project will deliver more accessible and welcoming spaces for all user groups and provide areas where people can spend time outside their workplace environment. Pedestrian crossings would be improved across the project area, introducing tactile paving where required. The removal of parking is mitigated by the existence of pay&display and disabled bay in the nearby area, and the relocation of the motorcycle bay will be to a section of a street nearby. A “Test of Relevance: Equality Analysis” has been undertaken and the outcome is that given the scale and scope of the scheme a full Equalities impact assessment is not required at this stage.	The project will deliver a minor increase in footway space due to the narrow condition of the streetscape. Pedestrian crossings would be improved across the project area, introducing tactile paving where required. The removal of parking is mitigated by the existence of pay&display and disabled bay in the nearby area, and the relocation of the motorcycle bay will be to a section of a street nearby.
20. Data Protection Impact Assessment	*NA*	As per option 1.
21. Recommendation	Recommended	Not recommended